

## 9<sup>th</sup> Session of the Meeting of the Parties

Brijuni, Croatia, 10 – 13 October 2022

### Draft Resolution 9.2: Amendment of the Annex to the Agreement



*The Meeting of the Parties to the Agreement on the Conservation of Populations of European Bats (hereafter “the Agreement”),*

*Recalling* Resolution 7 Amendment of the Agreement adopted at its third Session (Bristol, July 2000), which amends the Agreement and incorporates an Annex of bat species occurring in Europe to which the Agreement applies;

*Recalling* also that ‘Europe’ for the purposes of the Agreement is as defined in Doc. EUROBATS.MoP2.8.AnnexAFin (Resolution 2.5);

*Recognising* that there will be the need to amend the Annex from time to time in the light of recent research results;

*Further recognising* that the names of bat species included in the Annex should conform to the rules of nomenclature laid down by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature;

*Acknowledges* the establishment of an Advisory Panel of specialists to consider potential changes to the Annex;

*Agrees* to adopt the following changes to the Annex, on the recommendation of the Advisory Panel; and

*Notes* other potential changes to the Annex, but which are rejected or deferred pending the availability of further information;

*and*

*Decides to:*

1. Add the species *Myotis crypticus* Ruedi, Ibáñez, Salicini, Juste & Puechmaille, 2019 to the Annex to the Agreement;

2. Add the species *Myotis tschuliensis* Kuzyakin, 1935 and *Myotis hovei* Harrison, 1964 to the Annex to the Agreement;
3. Add the species *Plecotus gaisleri* Benda, Kiefer, Hanák & Veith, 2004 to the Annex to the Agreement;
4. Change the authorship of *Rhinolophus hipposideros* from (Borkhausen, 1797) to (André, 1797);
5. Amend the author name Keyserling to von Keyserling in the species *Eptesicus nilssonii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) and *Pipistrellus nathusii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839);
6. Amend the author name Bobrinskii to Bobrinskoj in the species *Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskoj, 1918;

and accordingly

*Adopts* the revised list of species for the Annex to the Agreement as attached to this Resolution in Annex I, with evidence for these revisions presented in Annex II.

## Annex I

### Bat species occurring in Europe to which the Agreement applies:

*[to be annotated following adoption of any changes by MoP9]*

#### **Pteropodidae**

*Rousettus aegyptiacus* (Geoffroy, 1810)

#### **Emballonuridae**

*Taphozous nudiventris* Cretzschmar, 1830

#### **Rhinolophidae**

*Rhinolophus blasii* Peters, 1866

*Rhinolophus euryale* Blasius, 1853

*Rhinolophus ferrumequinum* (Schreber, 1774)

*Rhinolophus hipposideros* (Borkhausen, 1797)

*Rhinolophus mehelyi* Matschie, 1901

#### **Vespertilionidae**

*Barbastella barbastellus* (Schreber, 1774)

*Barbastella caspica* Satunin, 1908

*Eptesicus anatolicus* Felten, 1971

*Eptesicus isabellinus* (Temminck, 1840)

*Eptesicus nilssonii* (Keyserling & Blasius, 1839)

*Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskii, 1918

*Eptesicus serotinus* (Schreber, 1774)

*Hypsugo savii* (Bonaparte, 1837)

*Myotis alcathoe* von Helversen & Heller, 2001

*Myotis bechsteinii* (Kuhl, 1817)

*Myotis blythii* (Tomes, 1857)

*Myotis brandtii* (Eversmann, 1845)

*Myotis capaccinii* (Bonaparte, 1837)

*Myotis dasycneme* (Boie, 1825)

*Myotis daubentonii* (Kuhl, 1817)

*Myotis davidii* (Peters, 1869)

*Myotis emarginatus* (Geoffroy, 1806)

*Myotis escaleraei* Cabrera, 1904

*Myotis myotis* (Borkhausen, 1797)

*Myotis mystacinus* (Kuhl, 1817)

*Myotis nattereri* (Kuhl, 1817)

*Myotis punicus* Felten, 1977

*Myotis schaubi* Kormos, 1934

*Nyctalus azoreum* (Thomas, 1901)

*Nyctalus lasiopterus* (Schreber, 1780)

*Nyctalus leisleri* (Kuhl, 1817)

*Nyctalus noctula* (Schreber, 1774)

*Otonycteris hemprichii* Peters, 1859

*Pipistrellus hanaki* Hulva & Benda, 2004

*Pipistrellus kuhlii* (Kuhl, 1817)

*Pipistrellus maderensis* (Dobson, 1878)

*Pipistrellus nathusii* (Keyserling & Blasius, 1839)

*Pipistrellus pipistrellus* (Schreber, 1774)

*Pipistrellus pygmaeus* (Leach, 1825)

*Plecotus auritus* (Linnaeus, 1758)

*Plecotus austriacus* (Fischer, 1829)

*Plecotus kolombatovici* Dulic, 1980

*Plecotus macrobullaris* Kuzyakin, 1965

*Plecotus sardus* Mucedda, Kiefer, Pidinchedda & Veith, 2002

*Plecotus teneriffae* Barrett-Hamilton, 1907

*Vespertilio murinus* Linnaeus, 1758

#### **Miniopteridae**

*Miniopterus pallidus* Thomas, 1907

*Miniopterus schreibersii* (Kuhl, 1817)

#### **Molossidae**

*Tadarida teniotis* (Rafinesque, 1814)

## **Annex II**

### **Review of Species to be listed on the Annex to the Agreement**

With reference to Resolution 3.7 (Doc.EUROBATS.MoP3.12.Rev.4), the attention of the Advisory Committee is drawn to the following matters, which may affect the Annex of bat species occurring in Europe and to which the Agreement applies. The Advisory Committee may wish to propose amendments to the Annex at the next MoP.

This updates similar documents produced for MoP5 (Doc.EUROBATS.MoP5.9, Inf.EUROBATS.MoP5.9, EUROBATS.MoP5.Record.Annex6), MoP6 (Doc.EUROBATS.MoP6.10, Inf.EUROBATS.MoP6.45, EUROBATS.MoP6.Record.Annex5) and MoP7 (Inf.EUROBATS.MoP7.48, EUROBATS.MoP7.Record.Annex5), and MoP8 (EUROBATS.MoP8.Resolution 8.2, Inf.EUROBATS.MoP8.9).

EUROBATS.MoP8.Resolution8.2 presents a list of species revised in accordance with amendments adopted at MoP8 (Monte Carlo, 2018). The report presented here includes recommendations for further changes to the Annex of species to which the Agreement applies. This report represents the opinions of members of an 'Advisory Panel' established for the purpose of assessing potential changes to the Annex of species. The panel comprises Stéphane Aulagnier (France), Petr Benda (Czech Republic), Gabor Csorba (Hungary), Javier Juste (Spain), Sergei Kruskop (Russian Federation), Peter Lina (Netherlands) and Friederike Spitzenberger (Austria) and co-ordinated by Tony Hutson (UK). This panel has no 'official' nomenclatural status. As 'ex-officio', Danilo Russo (chairman of EUROBATS Advisory Committee) and Suren Gazaryan (Secretariat to EUROBATS) are also circulated for information and comment.

*Mammal Species of the World* has been regarded by the International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN) and CMS as the standard list of mammals (see UNEP/CMS/Recommendation 9.4). A revised (3rd) edition (with the bats compiled by Nancy Simmons of the American Museum of Natural History) was published in early 2006 (Simmons, 2005). It has been recommended that unless there is over-riding reason, the Agreement should (in line with the policy of IUCN, CMS and others) adopt at least the generic (and higher) classification proposed in this work but may adopt changes to the species list as appropriate. However, Simmons (op. cit.) recognised that the higher classification of bats is in a state of flux and refrained from presenting a new higher-level classification. Further, it should be noted that this list is now 17 years old. It is, therefore, considered that well-supported revision of higher classification should be considered in maintaining the Annex of species. The *Handbook of the Mammals of the World, Vol 9*

*Bats* (Wilson & Mittermeier, 2019) provides an updated list and classification and can act as a benchmark. The report presented here may contribute to maintaining the online constantly up-dated *Bat Species of the World – A taxonomic and geographical database* (Simmons & Cirranello [2022]; <http://batnames.org>.) and the American Society of Mammalogists' Mammal Diversity Database (<http://mammaldiversity.org/>).

As far as is possible, the Annex to the Agreement will agree with the species list for the forthcoming revised Atlas of European Mammals (expected 2024).

Nomenclature should conform to the rules proposed by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature (ICZN, 1999).

### **Potential amendments to the Annex at MoP9**

#### **1. *Myotis nattereri*-group: *Myotis crypticus* Ruedi, Ibáñez, Salicini, Juste & Puechmaille 2019**

Following Ibáñez et al. 2006, *Myotis escalerae* Cabrera 1904 was recognised as distinct from *M. nattereri* by García-Mudarra et al. (2009). At the same time, these authors suggested that further taxa might be separable within the *Myotis nattereri*-species group complex and identified *Myotis* sp A and *Myotis* sp B. These two taxa have been referred to as such widely in subsequent literature until 2019, when two papers almost simultaneously gave formal names to these species.

*Myotis* sp A was described as *Myotis crypticus* Ruedi, Ibáñez, Salicini, Juste & Puechmaille 2019 (in Juste et al. 2019; type locality La Rioja, Spain; distribution central and northern Spain, southern France, Italy and probably adjacent south-western parts of Austria) and as *M. nattereri helverseni* Çoraman, Mayer & Dietz 2019 (in Çoraman et al. 2019).

*Myotis* sp B was described as *M. zenatius* Ibáñez, Juste, Salicini, Puechmaille & Ruedi 2019 (in Juste et al. 2019; type locality Tetouan, Morocco; distribution Morocco & Algeria) and as *M. escalerae cabreræ* Çoraman, Mayer & Dietz, 2019 (in Çoraman et al. 2019). Although electronic publication of the paper by Çoraman et al. appears to have been published very shortly before the paper by Juste et al., the descriptions are considered to fail to meet the requirements of the ICZN for the recognition of a new species by electronic publication for the reasons given in Ruedi et al. (2019) and the names *helverseni* and *cabreræ* for these taxa are considered as *nomina nuda*. They may also fail to meet the requirements of the ICZN for the subsequent printed version (in which case the names would remain available).

**Recommendation:** the species *Myotis crypticus* Ruedi, Ibáñez, Salicini, Juste & Puechmaille 2019, type locality Spain, should be added to the Annex to the Agreement.

## 2. *Myotis nattereri*-group: *M. tschuliensis* Kuzyakin, 1935, *M. araxenus* Dahl, 1947, *M. hovei* Harrison, 1964

Çoraman et al. (2019) also recognised *M. tschuliensis* Kuzyakin, 1935, *M. araxenus* Dahl, 1947, *M. hovei* Harrison, 1964 as separate species. They are discussed as ‘sp. nov.’, but should be ‘stat. rev.’ or ‘stat. nov.’.

*M. tschuliensis* Kuzyakin, 1935 (type locality Turkmenistan) was described as a subspecies of *M. nattereri* (*Bulletin de la Société des Naturalistes de Moscou* 44: 434,447).

*M. araxenus* Dahl, 1947 (type locality Armenia) was described as a subspecies of *M. nattereri* (*Doklady Akademii Nauk Armyanskoi SSR* 7: 173-178) and later regarded as a synonym of *M. schaubi* Kormos, 1934.

*M. hovei* Harrison, 1964 (type locality Israel) was described as a subspecies of *M. nattereri* (*Zeitschrift für Säugetierkunde* 29: 179-181).

*The Handbook of Mammals of the World* recognises *araxenus* as a synonym of *schaubi*, and recognises *tschuliensis* and *hovei* as subspecies of *M. nattereri* pending further investigation. However, a recent paper by Uvizl & Benda (2021) does recognise *tschuliensis* and *hovei* as distinct species based on morphology and molecular genetic analysis. Smirnov et al. (2020) had also recognised ‘*M. cf tschuliensis*’ as a species, but had been unsure about the application of this species name. *M. tschuliensis* is recorded from Ukraine, Russian Federation, Georgia, Azerbaijan, Armenia, Türkiye (as well as Iran and Turkmenistan), and *hovei* from Cyprus, Türkiye (as well as Syria, Jordan, Lebanon and Israel). *M. hovei* is also accepted as a species by the AMNH Bat List (Simmons & Cirranello [2022]).

**Recommendation:** *M. araxenus* Dahl should continue to be regarded as a synonym (or subspecies) of *M. schaubi*; the species *M. tschuliensis* Kuzyakin, 1935 (type locality: Turkmenistan) and *M. hovei* Harrison, 1964 (type locality: Israel) should be added to the Annex to the Agreement.

## 3. *Myotis nattereri*-group: *Myotis* sp C

A further species of the *M. nattereri*-group, *M. sp. C* (type locality Corsica, France) has been recognised by Puechmaille et al. (2012) and is awaiting formal description.

**Recommendation:** no action until formal publication of the species.

#### **4. *Plecotus gaisleri* Benda, Kiefer, Hanák & Veith, 2004**

This taxon is recorded in North-west Africa from North-west Libya (type locality) to Morocco. The status and distribution (including Europe) of this taxon was discussed for MoP8 (see Inf.EUROBATS.MoP8.9) but was left unresolved. Further research suggests that there seems general agreement that the taxon is distinct and that it occurs on Malta and Pantelleria (Italy), but that there is disagreement as to whether it should be regarded as a species or subspecies. Mifsud & Vella (2019), Batsleer et al. (2019), and Ancillotto et al. (2020) regard it as a species, whereas Spitzenberger (2020) gives a reasoned argument for retaining it as a subspecies. Razgour (2020) summarises the history of the nomenclature of this taxon. It is regarded as a full species in Wilson & Mittermeier (2019) and Simmons & Cirranello.

For the purposes of the Annex, a majority of those consulted recommend regarding this as a species and hence to be added to the Annex, but there is widespread opinion that this matter may not be settled and further research may recommend that on taxonomic grounds this taxon again be relegated to subspecies.

**Recommendation:** The species *Plecotus gaisleri* Benda, Kiefer, Hanák & Veith, 2004 should be added to the Annex to the Agreement.

#### **5. *Rhinolophus hipposideros* (André, 1797)**

The last MoP (MoP8) adopted a change of authorship for *Rhinolophus hipposideros* from Bechstein 1800 to Borkhausen 1797 (see Inf.EUROBATS.MoP8.9). Benda & Mlikovsky (2022) have further investigated this and find that the earliest valid binomial description of the species is by André (1797), where the species is described under the binomen *Noctilio hipposideros*; they show that André's work was published by 19 April 1797, whereas Borkhausen's work (1797) was not published by March and probably not in April, but certainly by 30 September 1797. Thus, although both works were published in the same year, André's work has priority over that of Borkhausen.

**Recommendation:** Amend *Rhinolophus hipposideros* (Borkhausen, 1797) to *Rhinolophus hipposideros* (André, 1797) in the Annex to the Agreement.

#### **6. *Eptesicus nilssonii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839), *Pipistrellus nathusii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839)**

It has been suggested that if we accept the prefix "von" for von Helversen (as in the co-author of *Myotis alcathoe* von Helversen & Heller, 2001), we should also accept such a prefix for von Keyserling (co-author of *Eptesicus nilssonii* (von Keyserling & Blasius,

1839) and *Pipistrellus nathusii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839); both these authors published the bat names under their family names including that prefix.

**Recommendation:** Amend *Eptesicus nilssonii* (Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) and *Pipistrellus nathusii* (Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) to *Eptesicus nilssonii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) and *Pipistrellus nathusii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) in the Annex to the Agreement.

## 7. *Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskoj, 1918

It has been pointed out that the author of the species *Eptesicus ognevi* should be Bobrinskoj (Бобринской) and not Bobrinskii or Bobrinskij. Although this zoologist himself later changed his name in accordance with a new (post-revolution) Russian grammar to Bobrinskij (Бобринский) and published many papers and books under this version of his name, the species *E. ognevi* was described before this change of the grammar and of the name; equally, for the famous Russian writer nobody uses the name Tolstyj (meaning fat, obese) in accordance with the current grammar, but rather the traditional version of the name, Tolstoj or Tolstoj; this is an identical case to that of Bobrinskoj/Bobrinskij.

**Recommendation:** Amend *Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskii, 1918 to *Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskoj, 1918 in the Annex to the Agreement.

## Summary

The following changes are recommended for the Annex of species to which the Agreement applies:

1. The species *Myotis crypticus* Ruedi, Ibáñez, Salicini, Juste & Puechmaille, 2019 should be added to the Annex to the Agreement.
2. The species *Myotis tschuliensis* Kuzyakin, 1935 and *Myotis hovei* Harrison, 1964 should be added to the Annex to the Agreement.
3. The species *Plecotus gaisleri* Benda, Kiefer, Hanák & Veith, 2004 should be added to the Annex to the Agreement.
4. *Rhinolophus hipposideros* (André, 1797) should replace *Rhinolophus hipposideros* (Borkhausen, 1797) in the Annex to the Agreement.
5. *Eptesicus nilssonii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) and *Pipistrellus nathusii* (von Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) should replace *Eptesicus nilssonii* (Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) and *Pipistrellus nathusii* (Keyserling & Blasius, 1839) in the Annex to the Agreement.
6. *Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskoj, 1918 should replace *Eptesicus ognevi* Bobrinskii, 1918 in the Annex to the Agreement.

## References

Ancillotto, L., Bosso, L., Smeraldo, S., Mori, E., Mazza, G., Herkt, M., Galimberti, A., Ramazzotti, F. & Russo, D. 2020. An African bat in Europe, *Plecotus gaisleri*: biogeographic and ecological insights from molecular taxonomy and species distribution models. *Ecology and Evolution* 10: 5785–5800.

Batsleer, F., Portelli, E., Borg, J. J., Kiefer, A., Veith, M., & Dekeuleire, D. 2019. Maltese bats show phylogeographic affiliation with North-Africa: implications for conservation. *Hystrix, the Italian Journal of Mammalogy* 30: 172–177.

André C. C. 1797. *Der Zoologe, oder Compendiöse Bibliothek des Wissenswürdigsten aus der Thiergeschichte und allgemeinen Naturkunde. Erste Band. Heft 5–8*. Eisenach & Halle: Johann Jacob Gebauer, [xiv]+416 pp.

Borkhausen, M.B. 1797. *Deutsche Fauna, oder kurzgefasste Naturgeschichte der Thiere Deutschlands. Erster Theil, Säugethiere und Vögel*. Barrentrapp und Wenner, Frankfurt-am-Main. 620 pp.

Çoraman, E., Dietz, C., Hempel, E., Ghazaryan, A., Levin, E., Presetnik, P., Zagmajster, M. & Mayer, F. 2019. Reticulate evolutionary history of a Western Palaearctic bat complex explained by multiple mtDNA introgressions in secondary contacts. *Journal of Biogeography* 46: 343-354.

Benda, P. & Mlíkovský, J. 2022. Nomenclatural notes on the lesser horseshoe bat, *Rhinolophus hipposideros* (Mammalia: Chiroptera). *Journal of the National Museum (Prague), Natural History Series* 191: 5-14.

García-Mударra, J.L., Ibáñez, C. & Juste, J. 2009. The Straits of Gibraltar: barrier or bridge to Ibero-Moroccan bat diversity. *Biological Journal of the Linnaean Society* 96(2): 434-450.

Ibáñez, C., García-Mударra, J.L., Ruedi, M., Stadelmann, B. & Juste, J. 2006. The Iberian contribution to cryptic diversity in European bats. *Acta Chiropterologica* 8(2): 277-297.

International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature 1999. *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature*. International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London. 306pp.

Juste, J., Ruedi, M., Puechmaille, S.J., Salicini, I. & Ibáñez, C. 2019. Two new Cryptic bat species within the *Myotis nattereri* species complex (Vespertilionidae, Chiroptera) from the Western Palaearctic. *Acta Chiropterologica* 20(2): 285-300.

- Mifsud, C. M. & Vella, A. 2019. Mitochondrial genetic diversity of bat species from the Maltese Islands and applications for their conservation. *Natural and Engineering Sciences*, 4 (3), 276–292. <https://doi.org/10.28978/nesciences.646348>
- Puechmaille, S.J., Allegrini, B., Boston, E.S.M., Dubourg-Savage, M.-J., Evin. A., Knochel, A., Bris, Y.Le, Lecoq, V., Lemaire, M., Rist, D. & Teeling, E.C. 2012. Genetic analyses reveal further cryptic lineages within the *Myotis nattereri* species complex. *Mammalian Biology* 77(3): 224-228.
- Razgour, O. 2020. *Plecotus austriacus* species complex (*P. austriacus*, *P. kolombatovici*, *P. gaisleri*, *P. teneriffae*). In Hackländer, K. & F. E. Zachos (eds.), *Handbook of the Mammals of Europe*. Springer Nature, Cham, 36pp. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-65038-8\\_73-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-65038-8_73-1).
- Ruedi, M., Puechmaille, S.J., Ibáñez, C. & Juste, J. 2019. Unavailable names in the *Myotis nattereri* species complex. *Journal of Biogeography* 46(9): 2145-2146. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/jbi.13665>.
- Simmons, N.B. 2005. Order Chiroptera. Pp 312-529 in Wilson, D.E. & Reeder, D.M., *Mammal Species of the World; A taxonomic and geographical reference (third edition)*. John Hopkins University Press, Baltimore. 2142pp.
- Simmons, N.B. & Cirranello, A.L. [2022]. *Bat Species of the World – A taxonomic and geographical database*. Compiled and edited by Nancy B. Simmons and Andrea L. Cirranello, American Museum of Natural History, updated with the IUCN BSG Global Bat Taxonomy Working Group (chaired by Nancy Simmons). <http://batnames.org>.
- Smirnov, D.G., Vekhnik, V.P., Dzhamirzoyev, G.S., Titov S.V. 2020. On the taxonomic status of species from the group *Myotis nattereri* (Chiroptera, Vespertilionidae) in the eastern Caucasus. *Zapoved Nauka (Nature Conservation Research)* 5 (4):1–13.
- Spitzenberger, F. 2020. The systematic status of the Libyan bats of the genus *Plecotus* (Chiroptera: Vespertilionidae). *Lynx*, n. s. (Praha), 51: 219–221.
- Uvizl, M. & Benda, P. 2021. Diversity and distribution of the *Myotis nattereri* complex (Chiroptera: Vespertilionidae) in the Middle East: filling the gaps. *Mammalian Biology* 101:963–977. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42991-021-00143-0>
- Wilson, D.E. & Mittermeier, R.A. (eds) (2019). *Handbook of the Mammals of the World. Vol. 9. Bats*. Lynx Edicions, Barcelona. 1008pp.